

Minutes		Date: 24-25 May 2019
CED GENERAL MEETING		Venue: Hofburg, Zeremoniensaal, 1010 Vienna, Austria
		Time start: 9:00 Time end: 12:00
Chair	Dr Marco Landi, CED President	
Participants	See list attached	
Representatives of the Brussels Office	Nina Bernot, Lea Pfefferle, Aneta Tyszkiewicz and Ainhua Zamacona	
1. Welcome, quorum and apologies		Rapporteur: Marco Landi
Working document	List of Participants	
The President welcomed the participants. Apologies from Audrey Camilleri who arrived late. The quorum was established.		
2. Welcome Address by the President of the Austrian Dental Chamber		Rapporteur: Thomas Horejs
Dr. Thomas Horejs addressed the General Meeting to welcome participants on behalf of the Austrian Dental Chamber. He explained that the Austrian Dental Chamber has always played an active role in the CED. Dr. Horejs stressed that as Europe is becoming more important the CED's role is more significant and CED's position papers and information on different topics are being used during national level discussions with authorities. Dr. Horejs mentioned dental chains and CED's position on the subject. Dr. Horejs thanked the event organisers and wished everybody a nice stay in Vienna.		
3. Approval of the agenda		Rapporteur: Marco Landi
Working document	• CED-GM-A-2019-01-E/D/F	
The agenda was approved.		
4. Notification of the minutes of the last General Meeting		
Working document	• Minutes of CED General Meeting on 16 November 2018 in Brussels (CED-GM-M-2018-02-E/D/F)	
No comments were received and the minutes were adopted by email.		
5. Report from the President		Rapporteur: Marco Landi
The President informed a) that the Board has agreed on a conflict of interest policy. The purpose of the policy is to preserve the reputation and independence of the CED and individuals who are involved in CED work. In line with the policy, CED Board members are required to declare conflict of interest at the start of the mandate and then annually. For participants of CED WG and TF meetings, there will be a regular item put on the agenda of each meeting as an opportunity to declare any conflict of interest. The policy will be uploaded on the CED website after the GM and will be reviewed and if necessary, amended before November 2021 b) that the Board also agreed on a confidentiality policy: all Board discussions are in principle open with some exceptions (for instance, when discussing individuals).		
6. Report from the Brussels Office		Rapporteur: Nina Bernot, Lea Pfefferle, Aneta Tyszkiewicz
Nina Bernot a) introduced the new Office Manager of the Brussels Office, Ainhua Zamacona; b) thanked the General Meeting for all the comments received on the working documents and informed that all the amended documents had been sent via e-mail; c) explained the voting procedure using the voting cards.		

Lea Pfefferle a) gave an insight about the political context in Brussels during the European pre-election period and informed about the election timeline and the possible political scenarios; b) mentioned that no further information on Brexit was available

Aneta Tyszkiewicz a) provided an overview on the Council Presidencies (2019-2020 Trio) and their priorities; b) mentioned the documents on which the General Meeting would vote and discuss; c) reminded the participants about topic tables organised during lunch and encouraged them to provide feedback about the meeting through the GM evaluation survey.

7. Finances		Rapporteur: Mick Armstrong
Working documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Report of the auditors: Final Accounts 2018 (CED-DOC-2019-020-E) • Treasurer's letter to members (CED-DOC-2019-021-E) • CED Final Accounts 2018 (CED-ACCOUNTS-2018-01-REV2) • CED Budget 2019 (CED-BUDGET-2019-02) • CED Budget 2020 (CED-BUDGET-2020-01) • CED hosting policy (CED-DOC-2019-022-E) 	
Treasurer	Introduced CED finances in line with the Treasurer's letter. 2018 was a complex year for CED finances, mainly because of the move to the new office and staff absences and changes. The delegates will be asked to adopt the Final Accounts for 2018, the amended Budget for 2019 (reflecting the admission of the new Albanian Observer), the Budget for 2020 (with an average increase in membership fees of 2,5%, only slightly above the inflation rate which is 2%), and the amended hosting policy (to reflect the new categories of membership).	
Auditor	Maarten Lindemans, the CED's statutory auditor, reported via videoconference on 2018 finances and the auditing process, in line with his written report. There were not questions or comment from the General Meeting.	
Nikolai Sharkov	Expressed his disagreement with the intention to increase membership fees by 2,5% in 2020 as this could be problematic for smaller countries.	
President	Explained that the 0,5% increase over inflation is intended to slowly build up CED reserves.	
Treasurer	Confirmed that the Board is extremely mindful of increasing costs but that adequate funding is required to allow the CED to carry out its work. He thanked CED staff for careful financial management.	
Michael Frank	Thought that the proposed 2,5% increase was reasonable.	
Decision	The Final Accounts 2018, the Budget 2019 and the CED hosting policy were adopted unanimously. The Budget 2020 was adopted with two abstentions.	
8. Communications		Rapporteur: Nina Bernot
Working document	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CED Annual Report 2018 	
Secretary General	Reported about the publication of the 2018 Annual Report, activities in connection to European Parliament elections and planned communications work.	
Orlando Monteiro da Silva	Suggested that the CED needs to have a broader approach to its communications; specifically, its communications should be also aimed at health regulators on EU and national level, at the economic sector and at consumer and patient organisations.	
President	Thanked him for his position. Explained that the CED already collaborates with patient and consumer associations whenever possible and that it tries to give proper communication tools to the Members to lobby all relevant stakeholders in their countries.	

9. Presentation of the Order of Dentists of Albania		Rapporteur: Adolf Derstila
Adolf Derstila	Presented Albania, development of dentistry in Albania and the structure and functioning of the Order of Dentists of Albania.	
President	Thanked him for the interesting information and welcomed the Order of Dentists of Albania to the CED.	
10. BTF Internal Market		Rapporteur: Freddie Sloth-Lisbjerg
Working documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brussels Office Update on the BTF Internal Market (CED-DOC-2019-023-E) • Draft Statement on Advertising (CED-DOC-2019-017-REV1-E/D/F) • Summary of the Questionnaire on VAT on dental laboratory work (CED-DOC-2019-032-E) 	
The chair a) thanked the BTF Internal Market for appointing him as the new chair and thanked Alexander Tolmeijer for his work as the previous chair; b) introduced the 2019 priorities – corporate dentistry, advertising, professional liability, implementation of the proportionality test directive and partial access; c) explained the reasons for proposing a statement on advertising and the key points of this statement; d) handed over to Matti Pöyry to summarise the findings of the survey on VAT on laboratory work, which showed that most countries do not collect VAT on such services.		
President	Stated that the Board considered all the comments received in advance on the advertising paper and worked hard to find a compromise, i.e. the proposed statement. Highlighted that this statement can be used according to national needs.	
Pierluigi Delogu	Informed that there was a reversal of the trend on advertising in Italy and that a 2018 law gave powers to the Chambers to sanction misleading health advertising.	
Orlando Monteiro da Silva	Explained that misleading advertisement can have a very negative impact especially in healthcare system where oral health is not covered by publicly financed healthcare services. Stressed that the document is not strong enough on unfair practices. Recalled the letter that was sent by the Board on behalf of the Portuguese Dental Authorities to the Portuguese Authorities in 2015 regarding advertising. Highlighted that the term unnecessary treatments might confuse patients.	
Marek Szewczyński	Suggested to use not medically indicated services instead of treatment. Encouraged to clearly differentiate between advertising and information to the patient and asked to include examples of unfair practices in the statement.	
Roman Šmucler	Described the proposed changes in the Czech law and invited the profession to look at the regulation on advertisement that other health stakeholders have already proposed.	
Michael Frank	Expressed that the main problem are corporate dental chains that advertise aggressively while the chamber does not have any possibility to challenge their behaviour.	
President	Affirmed that the Board agreed to re-open that position on corporate dentistry at the November 2019 General Meeting to include wording on oversight of dental chains/corporates by chambers or dental associations where possible.	
Ioannis Tzoutzas	Suggested to use the wording induced demand or induced treatment protocols instead of unnecessary treatment.	
Filipa Carvalho Marques	Asked for clarification on the intended audience of the statement and the lobbying rules under Belgian law, i.e. if national associations could be held liable for statements made by the CED.	
President	Recalled that advertising laws are made by national legislators and the CED's aim is to make a more general statement that can be used by all national dental associations.	
Beat Wäckerle	Suggested to remove the word "unnecessary".	
Freddie Sloth-Lisbjerg	Explained that the statement is meant for legislators, dentists and patients. Stressed that competition authorities are monitoring discussions on pricing in many countries.	

	Emphasised that the difference between information and advertising is often floating. Asked delegates to send examples of unfair practices to the CED office.
Nico Diederich	Asked for clarification on how advertising rules work cross-border, i.e. which legislation applies.
Edoardo Cavallé	Stressed that the statement sets out principles that can be used with the new European Parliament.
Rocío Mirallas	Recalled that advertising is an issue in Spain.
<i>During the lunch break the statement was amended to reflect the discussion by deleting 1) “in the market” and 2) “unnecessary”, and 3) by making bold “all operators” (all on page 3 of the statement)</i>	
Joakim Lilholt	Made a statement on behalf of the Nordic countries. Highlighted that the proposed statement is already of concern to them due to the references to pricing, which could lead to conflicts with the relevant national competition authorities. However, the Nordic countries would support the statement.
Orlando Monteiro da Silva	Asked for an indicative vote on the Portuguese proposal to amend the text to include wording on free treatment and payment plans.
President	Asked the delegates to cast their vote on the Portuguese proposal. The proposal was not approved.
Peter Engel	Stated that the vote was not against the Portuguese statement. No one wants discount pricing on the market, but it is already covered in the document.
Orlando Monteiro da Silva	Informed that the Portuguese Dental Association will send a declaration of vote to the CED office (<i>Note: the document was received and distributed to CED Members</i>).
President	Asked the delegates to cast their vote on the statement as amended during the lunch break.
Decision	The statement on advertising was adopted.
11. WG Education and Professional Qualifications	
Rapporteur: Paulo Melo	
Working documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Brussels Office Update on WG Education and Professional Qualifications (CED-DOC-2019-024-E) Draft CED resolution on CPD – 2019 update (CED-DOC-2019-010-E/D/F)
The Chair: a) informed about the finalisation of work on the CED resolution on CPD – 2019 update that is recommended for adoption; b) reported on the continuation of collaboration with EDSA and ADEE to call for the update of the Annex V.3/5.3.1 of Directive 2005/36/EC (PQD); c) presented the WG planned advocacy activities to call for the update of the Annex; d) shared the outcomes of the One Health Conference that took place in Paris last year, the next conference is about to take place in Poland, hosted by the Polish Chamber of Physicians and Dentists; e) informed about the participation of the CED President at the EU AMR One Health Network to introduce the CED activities on One Health; f) presented the next steps for the WG.	
Marek Szewczyński	Stressed that the Polish Chamber of Physicians and Dentists is looking forward to hosting the event on One Health in Warsaw. As a point of clarification, Marek highlighted that Poland is located in the Central Europe not as it was mentioned during the presentation in the Eastern Europe. <i>Note: Paulo Melo explained that the slides were prepared earlier before the final host country was revealed.</i>
President	Highlighted that the collaboration on One Health with other healthcare professionals is progressing well and the topic itself is very pertinent, attracting significant interest from the Member States side.

Decision	The CED resolution on CPD – 2019 update was unanimously adopted by the CED GM	
12. WG Dental Materials and Medical Devices		Rapporteur: Jane Renehan
Working documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Brussels Office Update on the WG Dental Materials and Medical Devices (CED-DOC-2019-025-E) Letter to the Commission on the Feasibility Study (CED-DOC-2019-026-E) Draft CED Statement on implementation of Medical Devices Regulation (CED-DOC-2019-027-E/D/F) 	
<p>The chair a) presented the CED Position on implementation of Medical Devices Regulation and explained the reason for drafting it; b) informed about the ongoing feasibility study on the possible phase-out of dental amalgam by 2030 and the CED webinar that was held on 20 March 2019, and encouraged delegates to share their responses to the feasibility study survey with the CED; c) asked delegates to share their national action plans on the phase-down of dental amalgam, which should be published by 1 July 2019, with the CED office.</p>		
Stefano Colasanto	Stefano Colasanto presented the Commission's reply to the question posed by the MEP Tamburrano concerning the implementation of the Medical Devices Regulation. Stressed that it was possible thanks to the advocacy effort of AIO team which resulted in the above-mentioned question.	
President	Thanked Stefano Colasanto for sharing the outcome of the AIO activities and informed that the link to the reply to the question will be distributed.	
Susie Sanderson	Informed delegates about the existence of a document prepared by the Scottish Dental Clinical Effectiveness Programme (SDECP) on restricting the use of dental amalgam in specific patient groups, which might be helpful for some other countries.	
President	Stressed the need for the CED to be informed about the national action plans.	
Decision	The CED Position on implementation of Medical Devices Regulation was unanimously adopted by the CED GM.	
13. Country Reports		Rapporteur: Delegates
Delegates from Malta, Ireland, Czech Republic, Bulgaria, Belgium, Greece, Germany, France, UK, Norway and Slovenia reported on developments in their respective countries.		
14. WG eHealth		Rapporteur: Piret Väli
Working documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Brussels Office Update on the WG eHealth (CED-DOC-2019-028-E) Draft CED resolution on online evaluation of dentists – 2019 update (CED-DOC-2019-012-E/D/F) 	
<p>The Chair a) informed that Patrizia Tosetti, the representative of the European Commission was a guest speaker at the WG meeting to present the Commission priorities in eHealth; b) provided more context on the need to update the CED resolution on online evaluation of dentists and mentioned the proposed amendment from the Polish Chamber of Physicians and Dentists; c) presented the EU initiatives having impact on health data exchange e.g. ePrescriptions, Patient Summaries, European Health Records; d) informed about the outcome of the discussion at the topic table on dental data set; e) stressed the WG priorities for coming months such as Artificial Intelligence; f) displayed the video of the Slovak Dental Chamber on eHealth solution in Slovakia and encouraged Members to produce their own promotional materials.</p>		
Michael Frank	Highlighted that we as an organisation do not have lots of influence on the unfair or false feedback. Therefore, the wording in the Resolution should be even stronger from <i>should to shall or must</i> .	
Marek Szewczyński	Suggested further strengthening the wording in the last bullet point of Resolution to <i>must</i> .	
Nico Diederich	Asked to amend the point in the Resolution referring to the vexatious information/content specifying that the dentist must be <i>immediately</i> informed about such comments.	
Peter Engel	Stressed that the pharmacist should know which medicine the patient is supposed to get and it should be a part of the information in the system.	

Hans Schrangl	Asked if the patient can check their data but also delete it. Piret Väli replied that the patient can hide the data but cannot delete it, there is an ongoing discussion if doctors should know that the information was hidden.
Victor Chan	Reaffirmed that the patient is the owner of their data and has a right to restrict the access to it. Piret Väli commented that in Estonia the patient can check who was looking at their data. Victor enquired if in case the diagnosis can make a harm to the patient, the doctor has a right to withhold it. Piret commented that if the doctor is not certain about the diagnosis, it should not be added to the general system. There should be a time for the proper consultation to which access should be restricted.
Elen Rowlands	Asked if the insurance companies have access to the health data information. Piret Väli stressed that yes, they need to know what was happening with the patient but without the financial background.
Alessandra Rossi	Highlighted that granting access to all health data to insurance companies could result in selective procedures in insuring patients based on their medical history. Piret Väli replied that it depends from country to country but in Estonia the private insurances are not linked to the system and cannot access this sort of information.
Michael Frank	Commented that currently in Germany, the healthcare professional is not authorised to keep the information from the patient. When it comes to the insurance companies, the patient is obliged to sign the form authorising the company to ask the doctor for the supplementary information. Continued that not much will change in a doctor – patient relation due to digitalisation only the format of the data will evolve. Added that the real problem is with the data security and the amount of data that can be stolen in case of hacking. Therefore, we should focus on security mechanisms to protect data.
President	Informed that often the private practitioners do not have access to the national health data set. For example, in Italy dentists do not have access to it. We should call for the access to data for all healthcare professionals, regardless if they are part of the public system or not.
Edoardo Cavallé	Shared his own experience where he has access to data but there is a traceability which shows which information was accessed and by whom. Also, the patient can conceal part of the file.
Nico Diederich	Enquired if the patient has the right for the data to not get collected. Piret Väli confirmed that yes, as before starting the treatment, dentists always ask for the consent to share patient's data and without it the data cannot be processed.
Decision	The CED resolution on online evaluation of dentists – 2019 update with the amendment inserted by the Polish Chamber of Physicians and Dentists and changes made during the meeting was unanimously adopted by the CED GM.
15. WG Oral Health	Rapporteur: Henk Donker
Working documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brussels Office Update on the WG Oral Health (CED-DOC-2019-029-E) • White Paper on Prevention (CED-DOC-2019-015-REV1-E/D/F) • Updated Mandate for the WG Oral Health (CED-DOC-2019-016-E/D/F)
The chair a) introduced the proposed white paper on prevention and its key messages; b) explained the updates to the working group mandate; c) shared the Board's intention to prepare a position on vaccination in the context of the growing importance of vaccination as a political topic; d) shared the invitation from the European Network for Smoking and Tobacco Prevention (ENSP) to join their working group on tobacco and dentistry.	
Discussion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The delegates welcomed the proposed paper on prevention as a useful document for discussion at the EU and national level. They discussed changes to the paper, including <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The introduction of a key messages on promoting proper oral hygiene; ○ Adding wording on antimicrobial stewardship;

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Differentiating between taxes and levies; ○ Adding advertising restrictions to the measures; ○ Promoting fluoridation of water where and if possible; ○ The creation of guidelines for people caring for vulnerable and older people; ○ Adding energy drinks; ○ Considering Universal Health Coverage (UHC); ○ Providing examples for best practice toolkits; ○ Supporting World Oral Health Day activities; ○ Adding several references and definitions.
<i>During the coffee break the paper was amended to reflect the discussion.</i>	
Decisions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The white paper was unanimously adopted. • The mandate was unanimously adopted.
16. WG Patient Safety, Infection Control and Waste Management Rapporteur: Ioannis Tzoutzas	
Working document	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brussels Office Update on WG Patient Safety, Infection Control and Waste Management (CED-DOC-2019-030-E)
The Chair a) informed about the ongoing discussion on patient safety and the need to update the existing CED Resolution on this topic; b) presented the results of the questionnaire on sedation in dentistry; c) flagged the upcoming revision of the CED Resolution on Nitrogen Oxide Sedation; d) stressed the necessity to focus further on the issue of dentistry and environment especially in the context of circular economy; e) presented the priorities for the WG for coming months.	
President	Encouraged all Members to reply to the CED questionnaires as it necessary for the information gathering.
17. BTF Antibiotics in Dentistry Rapporteur: Hans Schrangl	
Working document	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brussels Office Update on the BTF Antibiotics in Dentistry (CED-DOC-2019-031-E)
Informed about the ECDC survey on healthcare workers' knowledge of and attitudes towards AMR, in which more than 500 dentists participated, despite the technical problems. The report will be published for the 2019 European Antibiotic Awareness Day in November.	
Marek Szewczyński	Asked if the number of responses to the ECDC survey can be shared.
Susie Sanderson	Stated that the focus is shifting towards antimicrobial stewardship (AMS). The BDA and Public Health England have published documents, including a toolkit for auditing prescribing practices, for dentists that are available online.
President	Encouraged members to share useful links with the CED office that can be uploaded on the CED website.
Harry- Sam Selikowitz	Informed that FDI has an open access dropbox on AMR and AMS guidelines.
Any Other Business	
a) Dates and places of next meetings	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 22 November 2019, Brussels • 8-9 May 2020, Dubrovnik • 20 November 2020, Brussels • 19 November 2021, Brussels 	

PRESIDENT

BRUSSELS OFFICE
