

## // REPLIES TO THE CED ADEE PRESS RELEASE

### 1. Reply from UFP

Mr. President of CED,  
Mr. President of ADEE,

Dears Dr. Marco Landi and Prof. Stéphanie Tubert-Jeannin,

Please, find enclosed the statement of the University Fernando Pessoa regarding your Press Release of the 15 of March 2018 entitled « CED and ADEE call for compliance with PQD ». Last month, during a meeting in our University, Dr. Orlando Monteiro da Silva was so kind to let me know your Press Release as well as your position and concern on the quality of dentistry education within EU. Obviously, I fully agree with you and with all dentists' organizations that genuinely call for the compliance with PQD, in order « to prevent illegal education practices ». But I have to condemn all those organizations who, under mediatic, corporatist or political pressure, make general moral judgements on education practices of institutions they do not really know. Unfortunately, your Press Release was very unfair, unfriendly and even hostile for all « Portuguese private faculties » and particularly for our University, the only one you mentioned the name, trying to connect our institution with the activities judged illegal managed by CLESI and their other marketing names, we knew through your communiqué. The use of the name of the University Fernando Pessoa by that French association was/is so abusive as the use of our name by a Spanish/Canarian university that tries to deceive the students looking for our University, telling them falsely that they are our Canarian delegation. Regarding the responsibilities of your institutions and in order to be correctly informed about the University Fernando Pessoa and the quality of our staff and teaching, I would be very pleased if you decide to come to Porto and visit us. So, I am sure that you can prevent to make wrong judgements on our University.

Yours sincerely.

Salvato Trigo  
Rector of UFP

Attachment in the Annex I

## 2. Reply from the Catholic University in Portugal

Dear Dr. Marco Landi,  
Dear Members of the Board of CED,

I'm Prof. André Correia, Chair of the DMD Course of the Institute of Health Sciences of Viseu, of the *Universidade Católica Portuguesa* (Catholic University in Portugal).

Concerning the "Common Position Paper of CED and ADEE on the Professional Qualifications Directive (PQD)", we would like to express our position:

1st: The DMD course of our institution (Institute of Health Sciences, Viseu - Integrated Master in Dental Medicine, Catholic University of Portugal) is accredited by the "Agency for Assessment and Accreditation of Higher Education - A3ES" of the Portuguese State.

2nd: The contents of paragraph 6th and 7th, concerning the ESEM FRANCE / CLESI / Universidade Fernando Pessoa, are very worrisome. We have made a search in our Academic Services, and we have/had **no students** fulfilling those situations described in paragraph 7th.

If we can help in any other subject, please contact us.

Please receive our Best Regards,

**Prof. André Correia, DMD PhD**  
*Chair of the DMD Course*  
*Institute of Health Sciences, Viseu, Portugal*  
*Universidade Católica Portuguesa*

## 3. Reply form CESPU

The CESPU letter issued as a response to the *CED-ADEE call for compliance with PQD* paper - it states that [CESPU](#) university in Portugal fully respects PQD and none of their French students had recognition of studies performed at Fernando Pessoa University France, CLESI or ESEM France. The CESPU is a partner university with GEDS France. The GEDS France aims to create a link between French-speaking students and their European partner universities. Their services include promotion of partner universities, recruitment of students and assistance after graduation.

[Letter in the Annex II](#)

## **Annex I**

### **Statement on the legality and validity of the Master's degree in Dental Medicine, obtained at Universidade Fernando Pessoa (UFP), in Porto, by the students coming from CLESI.**

1. All the applicants to the “integrated” master’s degree in Dentistry (Dental Medicine), including those who came from CLESI or from any outside other provenance, are enrolled at the University Fernando Pessoa (UFP), in Porto, and follow their studies as full time students, under the legal conditions defined by the Portuguese law (Decreto-Lei nº 74/2006, of the 24th March, with the last amendment by the Decreto-Lei nº 63/2016, of the 13th September) and by the University’s academic rules.
2. The study plan completed by all the graduated students in Dental Medicine fully complies with the European Directive 2005/36 / EC as regards the duration of 300 ECTS ( 1 ECTS= 25 hours) with a minimum of 5,000 teaching hours of theoretical, practical and clinical training and of personal study.
3. The study plan, organized according to the Bologna declaration, consists of a first cycle (L1, L2 and L3 or 180 ECTS) and a second cycle (M1 and M2 or 120 ECTS). In Portugal, this structuring of the curriculum is called "Integrated Master in Dentistry". At the end of the first cycle, the students who apply for it receive a diploma of "License in Dental Sciences". The final diploma of the course is called "Diploma of Master in Dentistry". All this is very explicit in the Europass or the Diploma Supplement issued by the UFP in Portuguese and English.
4. All the core syllabus teaching units required by the European Directive, listed in Annex V.3 - 5.3.1, are present in the study plan and the students are evaluated in all those units, either by continuous knowledge assignments or by semester exams.
5. The practical and clinical training followed by all students is done over 5 semesters or 150 ECTS, the first of which is pre-clinical and introductory to the clinic. During clinical teaching and training, the students care real patients, under their informed consent, over 4 full-time semesters in the "Pedagogical Clinics" of the Faculty of Health Sciences of the UFP as well as at its Hospital-Escola (Hospital-School).
6. The applicants coming from CLESI, who are specifically pursued by the French Syndicat of Dentistry Students, supported by a Regional French Dentists Professional Association, and focused by the communiqué of the Council of European Dentists (CED) and of the Association for Dental Education in Europe (ADEE) were admitted to dental studies at our University, because the dossier they submitted met all the legal conditions laid down in the Portuguese law for access and for enrollment in higher education and in a Dentistry’s degree.
7. The free training and study program they had given over two years at the CLESI were not taken into account for their admission. After their formal registration at our University, all those applicants had the legal chance of applying for “creditation” or validation of the training they had done in France.
8. With their application, they delivered the contents of the subjects, the hours of lectures, the names of the trainers and the transcript of the notes they had obtained.
9. Their application was accepted within the legal framework provided for in Article 45 (1) (e)

of Decree-law nº. 74/2006 of 24 March, as amended by the Decree-law nº. 107/2008 of June 25; by the Decree-law nº. 115/2013 of 7 August; and by the Decree-law nº. 63/2016, of 13 September, in which letter e) of Article 45 passes to letter f) with the same content.

10. That Article 45 authorizes Portuguese public and private institutions of higher education, such as ours, to award ECTS (European credits) to various types of training followed by applicants for admission and enrollment in a Portuguese cycle of studies, prior to their application.
11. In the case of studies previously followed in France, at a training center such as CLESI, an applicant to our "Integrated Master of Dentistry", according to that legal standard [Article 45, nº1, letter f)], can be awarded up to one third of the total number of ECTS of the cycle of studies, that is, up to 100 ECTS, only by analyzing the file, as provided for in the Rules of "Creditation" of our University, published in the Diário da República (Official Journal), 2nd series, nº 108, of June 5, 2014.
12. Although our University could legally validate that training up to this limit of 100 ECTS, by accepting the file presented by CLESI applicants duly certified and apostillized by the Hague Apostille, the Scientific Board of the UFP has decided not to validate directly and only by administrative analyzing the training delivered by CLESI.
13. As a result of this decision, all the applicants who submitted a request for validation of the training made in CLESI had to pass written exams organized by UFP' teachers of the subjects (teaching units) to which the applicants were asking for the validation.
14. The validation of CLESI training was guaranteed only to successful applicants in the written exams whose level of knowledge was comparable to that of our students of the same year.
15. The applicants approved all exams were awarded of 100 ECTS corresponding roughly to the two-years training, prior to their entry in the UFP where they had to do normally the other 200 ECTS necessary to complete their master's degree in Dentistry.
16. Given that the total work unit, known as ECTS, is worth 25 hours at UFP (the European ECTS manual puts its unit value between 25 and 30 hours), all the students come from CLESI actually followed at UFP the minimum 5,000 hours (200 ECTS X 25 h) of training required by the European Directive, in addition to the 2,500 hours that have been validated under the Portuguese legislation above mentioned.
17. This is the truth of the facts, therefore I certify that the diplomas of the Master's degree in Dentistry, delivered at the UFP, in Porto, to the so-called CLESI students met not only all the requirements of the European Directive 2005/36 / CE but also the Portuguese legislation on the validation of studies and the certification of academic degrees by UFP.
18. CED and ADEE call for compliance with PQD refers to a so-called University Fernando Pessoa France, which never existed and so it couldn't be prohibited. CED and ADEE return to and repeat the hostile media campaign made against our University by French dental students' syndicates and some professional dentists' corporations, that always made a false picture of the University Fernando Pessoa, as an institution of higher education that doesn't comply with legal and quality requirements for teaching and delivering diplomas in Dentistry.
19. CED and ADEE should know that we have nothing to see with the activities of CLESI in

France or elsewhere, assuming its own name or disguised under other names. So, the attempt of connecting our University with the legal problems of that French Association 1901, giving to public opinion the idea that we do not comply with PQD, is an attack to our institutional image and to all those who work or study with us and are very confident of their University.

20. I hope that the explanation I'm sending you will be sufficient for having your respect. I assure you that the University Fernando Pessoa is a respectful institution very much committed with the quality of teaching and research on Dentistry and is very much committed to denounce each person or institution who use wrongly the name of our University.

Porto, 21st of April 2018.

The President / Rector of the UFP Prof.

Salvato TRIGO

**Annex II**

**Exmos. Senhores,  
President  
Bord Members  
GA**

**CED – Council of European Dentists**

---

**N/Ref.<sup>a</sup>:** GP/CESPU-10/17  
29, 2018

**Date:** March

**Subject: CED And ADEE Call for Compliance with PQD.**

The CESPUPolitécnico e Universitário, Crl, institution of IUCS -

Instituto Universitário de Ciências da Saúde, the oldest institution of higher education to teach Dental Medicine in Portugal, where this course has been taught since 1987.

As we have learned through the Portuguese Dental Association of the joint document of the Council of European Dentists (CED) and the ADEE (Association for Dental Education in Europe), published in February this year under the title "CED And ADEE Call for Compliance with PQD ".

In response to your document we have sent the attached IUCS letter. We remain available for any clarification that you deem relevant.

Thank you in advance for your attention, and we wish you all the best regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "António Almeida Dias", with a blue horizontal line underneath it.

António Almeida Dias, MD-PhD.  
President of CESPUPolitécnico e Universitário, Crl

Reitoria

Ex.mo Senhor

Professor Doutor António Almeida Dias

Presidente da CESPU, CRL

Nossa Referência: 29/R-IUCS/2017

Sua Referência:

Data: 23rd march 2018

Dear Sir,

We come to send you the position of IUCS about the the document «Common position paper of CED and ADEE on the professional qualifications Directive(PDQ)»:

The study plan of the Integrated Master's Degree in Dentistry (mestrado integrado in Medicina Dentária) of the Instituto Universitário de Ciências da Saúde (IUCS), which is in force, is the plan with the Registration No. R / B-AD-983/2007 published in the Portuguese Official Journal (attached copy).

This plan fully respects the Directive 2005/36/EC and subsequent Directive 2013/55 / EU, regarding the 5 years of the course and the number of teaching hours. In fact, the 300 ECTS of the course are spread over the 5 years, with 60 ECTS in each curricular year, in a workload of 8,400 total hours. It should be noted that at IUCS we consider that each ECTS corresponds to a total number of 28 hours.

Regarding the document issued by the CED and ADEE, and more specifically to what is referred to in the 7th paragraph, we inform you that all French students are presently enrolled and are attending the five years that comprise the Dentistry course.

We further inform that:

- none of our French students had recognition/accreditation of the studies performed at University Fernando Pessoa France, CLESI or ESEM FRANCE;
- until now none of the French students have completed their training at IUCS and only at the end of this academic year of 2017/2018 we expect to have the first French graduates in the Dentistry course at IUCS.

We therefore fully share the concerns of the institutions that have issued the document dated 20 February and we are in a position to ensure that all IUCS graduates in the Dentistry comply with the program described in Annex V, point 5.3.1 concerning the PQD and have the capacities and competences for the practice of Dentistry as required, by what we consider to be fully qualified for recognition of their diplomas for professional practice in the Member States.

With academic greetings

The

*Prof.*